



Lowlands and Uplands Scotland ERDF and ESF Programmes 2007 - 2013 Programme Monitoring Committee

EVALUATION ACTION PLAN – UPDATE ON ACTIVITIES

1. Purpose

1.1 To update PMC members on:

- activities in the past year;
- progress on recent projects;
- activities planned for 2010.

2. Activity in 2009

2.1 An evaluation “framework contract” was established in September 2008 which allows a shortened process for getting projects up and running. We have a three year agreement with three contractors, who are invited to bid for any new work. So far three contracts have been awarded using this procedure.

2.2 In the past year the following reports have been received

2.2.1 Evaluation of the ESF Shadow Round

This was begun before the framework contract existed. An Executive Summary was provided for the September PMC (LUPS/09/03/04 Annex 4). Some editing of the final version is still taking place but it will be published shortly.

2.2.2 Socio Economic And Policy Spot Check For LUPS

Published in March 2009¹. A presentation was given to the PMC in March (LUPS/09/01/05)

2.2.3 Socio Economic Spot Check For Highlands & Islands

A report has been received and presented to the European and External Relations Committee of the Scottish Parliament. Formal publication will follow very soon.

2.2.4 Evaluation of the Community Planning Partnerships - Phase 1

Baseline studies of the 13 CPPs have been produced plus an overall summary which was presented to the September PMC (LUPS/09/03/04 Annex 3iii).

2.3 An updated Evaluation Plan was submitted to the European Commission in June².

3. Planned Projects

- 3.1** The Monitoring and Evaluation Group (MEG) has met three times in 2009, most recently on 8 October. Future meetings should take place every three months (instead of every six as in earlier years). The attached tables (Annex 1) show the projects currently in the programme (some of these are commitments from the Operational Programmes³, others have been added since).
- 3.2** The MEG agreed that the next project should be an evaluation of the process of using Strategic Delivery Bodies (SDB) i.e. Scottish Enterprise, Highland and Islands Enterprise and the University of Highlands and Islands Millennium Institute. The aim of this study will be to compare approaches, assess how well the process is working, and to identify whether it brings any additionality. We hope that a contractor can be appointed before the end of the year, with work beginning in January 2010.
- 3.3** This should be followed fairly promptly (taking advantage of the framework contract) by a study to look at how well the cross cutting themes have been incorporated into the Programmes and individual projects, whether they have contributed to achieving some additionality, and identify good practice. This will look at both ESF and ERDF, in both LUPS and in H&I.
- 3.4** Also in 2010, it is expected that we will begin:
- a survey of ESF participants;
 - an evaluation of the Intermediate Administration Bodies (IAB);
 - an evaluation of publicity.
- 3.5** The most recent meeting of MEG also identified projects receiving awards of over £5 million, in order to seek assurance that independent evaluation is being carried out. Most of these are continuations of existing programmes, which have had recent evaluations. The main exception is JESSICA, which has only just been approved. Although we will not be leading on these we shall seek to ensure that the evaluations assess the difference made by access to Structural Funds.
- 3.6** In June we will present the Commission with a revised Evaluation Plan, with a timetable revised to take into account progress in implementing the Programmes.

4. Dissemination

- 4.1** It is our intention that all reports should be publicly available as soon as is practical after we receive them, primarily through the SG website⁴. We will be reviewing the website in 2010 to ensure that there is ready access to the research reports. We also wish to consider how the results of research can be packaged in ways to reach the appropriate audiences – whether that be policy makers, the European Commission or people delivering projects.

5. Recommendations

- 5.1** The Committee is invited to:
- 5.1.1 give formal approval for the planned activities;
 - 5.1.2 offer views on work that might be added to the plan;
 - 5.1.3 discuss how we ensure that the results of research reach the widest audience.

Paul Teasdale
Scottish Government
Tel: 03002 441092
Email: paul.teasdale@scotland.gsi.gov.uk

October 2009

- i <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity/socioeconomicevaluation>
- ii <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity/EvaluationPlan2007to2013>
- iii <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/OPLUPESF>
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/OPLUPERDF>
- iv <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity>

**EVALUATION ACTIVITIES 2007- 2013- COMPLETED AND PLANNED
OCT 2009 (Revised after MEG 7)**

Activities in shaded rows have been completed

Table 1: Process Evaluations

Evaluation	Scope	Key questions	Timetable	Who will evaluate	Steering group
Evaluation of shadow round projects	All Shadow Round projects of the two ESF Programmes	Did the supported projects address the goals of the programmes Did projects meet their targets Identify soft outcomes Did projects reach the hardest to help	Spec January 2008 Final Report due late 2009	Hall Aitken	Paula Docherty/ Wilma Price* ESFD Mabel Hildebrand ESFD Miranda McIntosh/ Jacqui Feeney* ESFD Anthony Moulds/Raakhi Odedra* (SG - Analytical Services) Liz Catterson (SG – Workforce Plus)
Framework Evaluation Contract	Bid to put together a pool of contractors to tender for evaluations of Structural Fund activities to end 2010	N/A	Invited April 2008 Appointed September 2008	N/A	Miranda McIntosh ESFD Billy McLaren ESFD Chris Garbutt (SG – Procurement)
Community Planning Partnerships in the LUPS area	Evaluation of successful CPP bids Phase 1 LUPS Phase 3 also includes H&I	How effective have the CPP projects been? Adding value to European funds Improved partnership? Identifying good practice	Contractor appointed – April 2009 Phase 1 reports – Sept 2009 Final Report (Phase 4) – November 2010	Blake Stevenson	Jacqui Feeney ESFD Brenda Russell ESFD Pearce Stewart ESFD Tony McGale ESFD Muriel Mackenzie ESEP Andy Lee (North Ayrshire Council) Raakhi Odedra (SG – Analytical Services)

Evaluation	Scope	Key questions	Timetable	Who will evaluate	Steering group
Strategic Report 2009 (Article 29)	Lead is with BIS discussed at MEG mid June 2009 Format set out by the Commission	tbc	To be with Commission by end of 2009	Internal & BIS	N/A
Strategic Delivery Bodies (SDBs)	UHI, HIE and SEn	Effectiveness of the process? Value added for the SDB and for Structural Funds? Lessons for partnership approach ?	Discussed by MEG in Oct 2009 Aim to award end 2009	External	To be arranged
Evaluation of IAB activity	Future role for IABs	tbc	Commitment in Operational Programme for end 2009 – now expected late 2010	External	tbc
Evaluation of Global Grant Body	To be combined with evaluation of IAB	tbc	Commitment in Operational Programme for end 2009 – now expected late 2010	External	Tbc

Evaluation	Scope	Key questions	Timetable	Who will evaluate	Steering group
Publicity (1 st review)	Impact of Programme publicity measures – required as part of AIR 2010 (submitted June 2011)	How effective have the publicity activities of the different Programmes been? What messages have been communicated?	Early 2010 – draft spec and discuss at MEG Early 2011 – external review complete.	External	tbc
Surveys of participants (the “beneficiaries survey”)	Two surveys of ESF participants	tbc	Commitment in Operational Programmes – end December 2011 and end 2014	External	tbc
Publicity (2 nd review)	Impact of Programme publicity measures – required as part of Final Report 2014/15	How effective have the publicity activities been? What messages have been communicated?	tbc	External	tbc

Table 2: Thematic Evaluations

List of currently-planned evaluations	Scope	Key questions	Timetable	Who will evaluate ?	Steering group
Socio-Economic and Policy Spot-check Report – Lowlands and Uplands Scotland		How can LUPS Programmes further assist counter-recessionary measures and policies to aid economic recovery?	Tenders invited Dec 2008 Final Report – March 2009	Fraser Associates	John Rigg ESFD Billy McLaren ESFD Jacqui Feeney ESFD Mabel Hildebrand ESFD David Souter ESFD Nigel Lindsey - ESFD
Socio-Economic and Policy Spot-check Report – Highlands and Islands		How can H&I Programmes further assist counter-recessionary measures and policies to aid economic recovery?	Tenders invited Dec 2008 Final Report – March 2009. Sent to Scottish Parliament Oct 2009 Addendum Sept 2009	Blake Stevenson	Jim Millard ESFD Billy McLaren ESFD Jacqui Feeney ESFD
Horizontal Themes Evaluation	All programmes - equal opportunities - social inclusion - environmental sustainability	tbc	To be discussed in MEG early 2010	External	tbc
Added Value of European Structural Funds	Possible future evaluation	tbc	tbc	tbc	tbc

Table 3: Project-Specific Evaluations*

All Projects with an award value of over £5m plus others if considered of particular significance

Project Name	Size of award	Total Fund	Match Funder	Lead	Notes	
Scottish Venture Fund	£20 million	£30 million	Scottish Enterprise	Connie Kay, (SEn)	A report was completed Oct 2008 Next report at the end of 2010	
Scottish Co-investment Fund	£26,666,667	£40 million	Scottish Enterprise	Connie Kay (SEn)	Reports completed in Sept 2007 and May 2008 Evaluation due in 2011	
West of Scotland Loan Fund	£6 million	£15 million	West of Scotland Loan Fund	Connie Kay (SEn)	Evaluation completed in Sept 2007 Evaluation due at the end of the programme	
SMART	£6,031,040	£24,124,160	Scottish Enterprise	Jessica Barr	Evaluation (by PACEC) just completed, Next one due in 2012	
JESSICA	£15 million	£30 million	Housing & Regeneration	For ESFD : David Souter	No plans yet.	

LINKS

- i <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity/socioeconomicevaluation>
- ii <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity/EvaluationPlan2007to2013>
- iii <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/OPLUPESF>
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/OPLUPERDF>
- iv <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Business-Industry/support/17404/ESF-Evaluation-Publicity>